



A call for an open, informed study of all aspects of consciousness

Etzel Cardena*

Department of Psychology, Lund University, Lund, Sweden

*Correspondence: etzel.cardena@psy.lu.se

Edited by: Christian Agrillo, University of Padova, Italy

Reviewed by: Imants Baruss, King's University College at The University of Western Ontario, Canada

Keywords: consciousness, scientific method, parapsychology, PSI, psychical research

Science thrives when there is an open, informed discussion of all evidence, and recognition that scientific knowledge is provisional and subject to revision. This attitude is in stark contrast with reaching conclusions based solely on a previous set of beliefs or on the assertions of authority figures. Indeed, the search for knowledge wherever it may lead inspired a group of notable scientists and philosophers to found in 1882 the Society for Psychical Research in London. Its purpose was “to investigate that large body of debatable phenomena... without prejudice or prepossession of any kind, and in the same spirit of exact and unimpassioned inquiry which has enabled Science to solve so many problems.” Some of the areas in consciousness they investigated such as psychological dissociation, hypnosis, and preconscious cognition are now well integrated into mainstream science. That has not been the case with research on phenomena such as purported telepathy or precognition, which some scientists (a clear minority according to the surveys conducted http://en.wikademia.org/Surveys_of_academic_opinion_regarding_parapsychology) dismiss *a priori* as pseudoscience or illegitimate. Contrary to the negative impression given by some critics, we would like to stress the following:

(1) Research on parapsychological phenomena (psi) is being carried out in various accredited universities and research centers throughout the world by academics in different disciplines trained in the scientific method (e.g., circa 80 Ph.D.s have been awarded in psi-related topics in

the UK in recent years). This research has continued for over a century despite the taboo against investigating the topic, almost complete lack of funding, and professional and personal attacks (Cardena, 2011). The Parapsychological Association has been an affiliate of the AAAS since 1969, and more than 20 Nobel prizewinners and many other eminent scientists have supported the study of psi or even conducted research themselves (Cardena, 2013).

(2) Despite a negative attitude by some editors and reviewers, results supporting the validity of psi phenomena continue to be published in peer-reviewed, academic journals in relevant fields, from psychology to neuroscience to physics e.g., (Storm et al., 2010; Bem, 2011; Hameroff, 2012; Radin et al., 2012).

(3) Increased experimental controls have not eliminated or even decreased significant support for the existence of psi phenomena, as suggested by various recent meta-analyses (Sherwood and Roe, 2003; Schmidt et al., 2004; Bösch et al., 2006; Radin et al., 2006; Storm et al., 2010, 2012, 2013; Tressoldi, 2011; Mossbridge et al., 2012; Schmidt, 2012).

(4) These meta-analyses and other studies (Blackmore, 1980) suggest that data supportive of psi phenomena cannot reasonably be accounted for by chance or by a “file drawer” effect. Indeed, contrary to most disciplines, parapsychology journals have for decades encouraged publication of null results and of papers critical of a psi explanation (Wiseman et al.,

1996; Schönwetter et al., 2011). A psi trial registry has been established to improve research practice <http://www.koestler-parapsychology.psy.ed.ac.uk/TrialRegistryDetails.html>.

(5) The effect sizes reported in most meta-analyses are relatively small and the phenomena cannot be produced on demand, but this also characterizes various phenomena found in other disciplines that focus on complex human behavior and performance such as psychology and medicine (Utts, 1991; Richard and Bond, 2003).

(6) Although more conclusive explanations for psi phenomena await further theoretical and research developments, they do not *prima facie* violate known laws of nature given modern theories in physics that transcend classical restrictions of time and space, combined with growing evidence for quantum effects in biological systems (Sheehan, 2011; Lambert et al., 2013).

With respect to the proposal that “exceptional claims require exceptional evidence,” the original intention of the phrase is typically misunderstood (Truzzi, 1978). Even in its inaccurate interpretation what counts as an “exceptional claim” is far from clear. For instance, many phenomena now accepted in science such as the existence of meteorites, the germ theory of disease, or, more recently, adult neurogenesis, were originally considered so exceptional that evidence for their existence was ignored or dismissed by contemporaneous scientists. It is also far from clear what would count as “exceptional evidence” or who would set that threshold.

Dismissing empirical observations *a priori*, based solely on biases or theoretical assumptions, underlies a distrust of the ability of the scientific process to discuss and evaluate evidence on its own merits. The undersigned differ in the extent to which we are convinced that the case for psi phenomena has already been made, but not in our view of science as a non-dogmatic, open, critical but respectful process that requires thorough consideration of all evidence as well as skepticism toward both the assumptions we already hold and those that challenge them.

Daryl Bem, Professor Emeritus of Psychology, Cornell University, USA

Etzel Cardena, Thorsen Professor of Psychology, Lund University, Sweden

Bernard Carr, Professor in Mathematics and Astronomy, University of London, UK

C. Robert Cloninger, Renard Professor of Psychiatry, Genetics, and Psychology, Washington University in St. Louis, USA

Robert G. Jahn, Past Dean of Engineering, Princeton University, USA

Brian Josephson, Emeritus Professor of Physics, University of Cambridge, UK (Nobel prizewinner in physics, 1973)

Menas C. Kafatos, Fletcher Jones Endowed Professor of Computational Physics, Chapman University, USA

Irving Kirsch, Professor of Psychology, University of Plymouth, Lecturer in Medicine, Harvard Medical School, USA, UK

Mark Leary, Professor of Psychology and Neuroscience, Duke University, USA

Dean Radin, Chief Scientist, Institute of Noetic Sciences, Adjunct Faculty in Psychology, Sonoma State University, USA Robert Rosenthal, Distinguished Professor,

- University of California, Riverside, Edgar P i e r c e
Professor Emeritus, Harvard University, USA Lothar Schäfer,
Distinguished Professor
Emeritus of Physical Chemistry, University of Arkansas, USA
Raymond Tallis, Emeritus Professor of Geriatric Medicine,
University of Manchester, UK
Charles T. Tart, Professor in Psychology Emeritus, University of
California, Davis, USA
Simon Thorpe, Director of Research CNRS (Brain and
Cognition), University of Toulouse, France
Patrizio Tressoldi, Researcher in Psychology, Università degli
Studi di Padova, Italy
Jessica Utts, Professor and Chair of Statistics, University of
California, Irvine, USA
Max Velmans, Professor Emeritus in Psychology, Goldsmiths,
University of London, UK
Caroline Watt, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, Edinburgh
University, UK
Phil Zimbardo, Professor in Psychology Emeritus, Stanford
University, USA
And...
P. Baseilhac, Researcher in Theoretical Physics, University of
Tours, France
Eberhard Bauer, Dept. Head, Institute of Border Areas of
Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany
Julie Beischel, Adjunct Faculty in Psychology and Integrated
Inquiry, Saybrook University, USA
Hans Bengtsson, Professor of Psychology, Lund University,
Sweden
Michael Bloch, Associate Professor of Psychology, University of
San Francisco, USA
Stephen Braude, Professor of Philosophy Emeritus, University
of Maryland Baltimore County, USA
Richard Broughton, Senior Lecturer, School of Social Sciences,
University of Northampton, UK
Antonio Capafons, Professor of Psychology, University of
Valencia, Spain
James C. Carpenter, Adjunct Professor of Psychiatry, University
of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA
Allan Leslie Combs, Doshi Professor of Consciousness
Studies, California Institute of Integral Studies, USA
Deborah Delanoy, Emeritus Professor of Psychology,
University of Northampton, UK
Arnaud Delorme, Professor of Neuroscience, Paul Sabatier
University, France
Vilfredo De Pascalis, Professor of General Psychology, "La
Sapienza" University of Rome, Italy
Kurt Dressler, Professor in Molecular Spectroscopy
Emeritus, Eidg. Techn. Hochschule Zürich, Switzerland
Hoyt Edge, Hugh H. and Jeannette G. McKean Professor of
Philosophy, Rollins College, USA
Sütbert Ertel, Emeritus Professor of Psychology, University
of Göttingen, Germany
Franco Fabbro, Professor in Child Neuropsychiatry, University
of Udine, Italy
Enrico Facco, Professor of Anesthesia and Intensive Care,
University of Padua, Italy
Wolfgang Fach, Researcher, Institute of Border Areas of
Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany
Harris L. Friedman, Former Research Professor of Psychology,
University of Florida, USA
Alan Gauld, Former Reader in Psychology, University of
Nottingham, UK
Antoon Geels, Professor in the Psychology of Religion Emeritus,
Lund University, Sweden
Bruce Greyson, Carlson Professor of Psychiatry and
Neurobehavioral Sciences, University of Virginia, Charlottesville,
USA
Erlendur Haraldsson, Professor Emeritus of Psychology,
University of Iceland, Iceland
Richard Conn Henry, Academy Professor (Physics and
Astronomy), The Johns Hopkins University, USA
David J. Hufford, University Professor Emeritus, Penn State
College of Medicine, USA
Oscar Iborra, Researcher, Department of Experimental
Psychology, Granada University, Spain
Harvey Irwin, former Associate Professor, University of New
England, Australia
Graham Jamieson, Lecturer in Human Neuropsychology,
University of New England, Australia
Erick Janssen, Adjunct Professor, Department of Psychology,
Indiana University, USA
Per Johnsson, Head, Department of Psychology, Lund
University, Sweden
Edward F. Kelly, Research Professor in the Department of
Psychiatry and Neurobehavioral Sciences, University of Virginia,
Charlottesville, USA
Emily Williams Kelly, Research Assistant Professor in the
Department of Psychiatry and Neurobehavioral Sciences,
University of Virginia, Charlottesville, USA
Hideyuki Kokubo, Researcher, Institute for Informatics of
Consciousness, Meiji University, Japan
Jeffrey J. Kripal, J. Newton Rayzor Professor of Religious
Studies, Rice University, USA
Stanley Krippner, Professor of Psychology and Integrated
Inquiry, Saybrook University, USA
David Luke, Senior Lecturer, Department
of Psychology and Counselling, University of
Greenwich, UK Fatima Regina Machado, Researcher,
Universidade de São Paulo, Brasil
Markus Maier, Professor in Psychology, University of Munich,
Germany
Gerhard Mayer, Researcher, Institute of Border Areas of
Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany
Antonia Mills, Professor First Nations Studies, University of
Northern British Columbia, Canada
Garret Moddel, Professor in Electrical, Computer, & Energy
Engineering, University of Colorado, Boulder, USA
Alexander Moreira-Almeida, Professor of Psychiatry,
Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Brasil
Andrew Moskowitz, Professor in Psychology and Behavioral
Sciences, Aarhus University, Denmark
Julia Mossbridge, Fellow in Psychology, Northwestern
University, USA
Judi Neal, Professor Emeritus of Management, University of
New Haven, USA
Roger Nelson, Retired Research Staff, Princeton University,
USA
Fotini Pallikari, Professor of Physics, University of Athens,
Greece
Alejandro Parra, Researcher in Psychology, Universidad Abierta
Interamericana, Argentina
José Miguel Pérez Navarro, Lecturer in Education, International
University of La Rioja, Spain
Gerald H. Pollack, Professor in Bioengineering, University of
Washington, Seattle, USA
John Poynton, Professor Emeritus in Biology, University of
KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa
David Presti, Senior Lecturer, Neurobiology and Cognitive
Science, University of California, Berkeley, USA
Thomas Rabeyron, Lecturer in Clinical Psychology, Nantes
University, France
Inmaculada Ramos Lerate, Researcher in Physics, Alba
Synchrotron Light Source, Barcelona, Spain.
Chris Roe, Professor of Psychology, University of Northampton,
UK
Stefan Schmidt, Professor, Europa Universität Viadrina,
Germany
Gary E. Schwartz, Professor of Psychology, Medicine, Neurology,
Psychiatry, and Surgery, University of Arizona, USA
Daniel P. Sheehan, Professor of Physics, University of San
Diego, USA

Simon Sherwood, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, University of Greenwich, UK
 Christine Simmonds-Moore, Assistant Professor of Psychology, University of West Georgia, USA
 Mário Simões, Professor in Psychiatry, University of Lisbon, Portugal
 Huston Smith, Prof. of Philosophy Emeritus, Syracuse University, USA
 Jerry Solfvín, Associate Professor in Indic Studies, University of Massachusetts, Dartmouth, USA
 Lance Storm, Visiting Research Fellow, University of Adelaide, Australia
 Jeffrey Allan Sugar, Assistant Professor of Clinical Psychiatry, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, USA
 Neil Theise, Professor of Pathology and Medicine, The Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, USA
 Jim Tucker, Bonner-Lowry Associate Professor of Psychiatry and Neurobehavioral Sciences, University of Virginia, USA
 Yulia Ustinova, Associate Professor in History, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Israel
 Walter von Lucadou, Senior Lecturer at the Furtwangen Technical University, Germany
 Maurits van den Noort, Senior Researcher, Free University of Brussels, Belgium
 David Vernon, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, Canterbury Christ Church University, UK
 Harald Walach, Professor, Europa Universität Viadrina, Germany
 Helmut Wautischer, Senior Lecturer in Philosophy, Sonoma State University, USA
 Donald West, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Criminology, University of Cambridge, UK
 N.C. Wickramasinghe, Professor in Astrobiology, Cardiff University, UK
 Fred Alan Wolf, formerly Professor in physics at San Diego State University, the Universities of Paris, London, and the Hebrew University of Jerusalem
 Robin Wooffitt, Professor of Sociology, University of York, UK
 Wellington Zangari, Professor in Psychology, University of Sao Paulo, Brazil
 Aldo Zucco, Professor, Dipartimento di Psicologia Generale, Università di Padova, Italy

Acknowledgments

Although for practical reasons only one author is listed, the call is a collective creation of the co-signatories.

References

Bem, D. J. (2011). Feeling the future: experimental evidence for anomalous retroactive influences on cognition and affect. *J. Pers. Soc. Psychol.* 100, 407–425. doi: 10.1037/a0021524
 Blackmore, S. (1980). The extent of selective reporting in ESP ganzfeld studies. *Eur. J. Parapsychol.* 3, 213–219.
 Bösch, H., Steinkamp, F., and Boller, E. (2006). Examining psychokinesis: the interaction of human intention with random number generators: a meta-analysis. *Psychol. Bull.* 132, 497–523. doi: 10.1037/0033-2909.132.4.497
 Cardeña, E. (2011). On wolverines and epistemological totalitarianism. *J. Sci. Explor.* 25, 539–551.
 Cardeña, E. (2013). Eminent authors from other areas. *Mindfield* 5, 83–90.
 Hameroff, S. (2012). How quantum biology can rescue conscious free will. *Front. Integr. Neurosci.* 6, 1–17. doi: 10.3389/fnint.2012.00093
 Lambert, N., Chen, Y.-N., Cheng, Y.-C., Li, C.-M., Chen, G.-Y., and Nori, F. (2013). Quantum biology. *Nat. Phys.* 9, 10–18. doi: 10.1038/nphys2474
 Mossbridge, J., Tressoldi, P. E., and Utts, J. (2012). Predictive physiological anticipation preceding seemingly unpredictable stimuli: a meta-analysis. *Front. Psychol.* 3:390. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2012.00390
 Radin, D., Michel, L., Galdamez, K., Wendland, R., Rickenbach, R., and Delorme, A. (2012). Consciousness and the double-slit interference pattern: six experiments. *Phys. Essays* 25, 157–171. doi: 10.4006/0836-1398-25.2.157
 Radin, D., Nelson, R., Dobyns, Y., and Houtkooper, J. (2006). Reexamining psychokinesis: comment on Bösch, Steinkamp,

and Boller. *Psychol. Bull.* 132, 529–532. doi: 10.1037/0033-2909.132.4.529

Richard, F. D., and Bond, C. F. Jr. (2003). One hundred years of social psychology quantitatively described. *Rev. Gen. Psychol.* 7, 331–363. doi: 10.1037/1089-2680.7.4.331

Schmidt, S. (2012). Can we help just by good intentions? a meta-analysis of experiments on distant intention effects. *J. Altern. Complement. Med.* 18, 529–533. doi: 10.1089/acm.2011.0321

Schmidt, S., Schneider, R., Utts, J., and Walach, H. (2004). Distant intentionality and the feeling of being stared at: two meta-analyses. *Br. J. Psychol.* 95, 235–247. doi: 10.1348/000712604773952449

Schönwetter, T., Ambach, W., and Vaitl, D. (2011). Does a modified guilty knowledge test reveal anomalous interactions within pairs of participants. *J. Parapsychol.* 75, 93–118.

Sheehan, D. (2011). Frontiers of time: quantum retrocausation. theory and experiments. *AIP Conf. Proc.* 1408, 255–278. doi: 10.1063/1.3663728

Sherwood, S. J., and Roe, C. A. (2003). A review of dream ESP studies conducted since the Maimonides Dream ESP programme. *J. Conscious. Stud.* 10, 85–109.

Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Di Risio, L. (2010). Meta-analyses of free-response studies 1992–2008, assessing the noise reduction model in parapsychology. *Psychol. Bull.* 136, 491–494. doi: 10.1037/a0019840

Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Di Risio, L. (2012). Meta-analysis of ESP studies, 1987–2010: assessing the success of the forced-choice design in parapsychology. *J. Parapsychol.* 76, 243–274.

Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Utts, J. (2013). Testing the Storm et al. (2010) meta-analysis using Bayesian and frequentist approaches: reply to Rouder et al. *Psychol. Bull.* 1, 248–254. doi: 10.1037/a0029506

Tressoldi, P. E. (2011). Extraordinary claims require extraordinary evidence: the case of non-local perception, a classical and Bayesian review of evidences. *Front. Psychol.* 2:117. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2011.00117

Truzzi, M. (1978). On the extraordinary: an attempt at clarification. *Zetetic Scholar* 1, 11–22.

Utts, J. (1991). Replication and meta-analysis in parapsychology. *Statist. Sci.* 6, 363–378. doi: 10.1214/ss/1177011577

Wiseman, R., Smith, M., and Kombrot, D. (1996). Exploring possible sender-to-experimenter acoustic leakage in the PRL autoganzfeld experiments. *J. Parapsychol.* 60, 97–128.

Received: 10 December 2013; accepted: 08 January 2014; published online: 27 January 2014.

Citation: Cardeña E (2014) A call for an open, informed study of all aspects of consciousness. *Front. Hum. Neurosci.* 8:17. doi: 10.3389/fnhum.2014.00017

This article was submitted to the journal *Frontiers in Human Neuroscience*.

Copyright © 2014 Cardeña. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) or licensor are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

